Anna

Dzierżyc

Horniak

A WOMAN IS A NOMADE,
A WOMAN IS AN ARTIST
A LOOK AT THE BRIDES
ON TOUR BY PIPPA BACCA
AND SILVIA MORO IN THE
FEMINIST VIEW OF ROSI
BRAIDOTTI



Feminism is a critical and life experience of discovering new womanbased versions of existence, creation and knowledge communication – as convinces Rosi Braidotti<sup>1</sup>, one of the most significant theoretists of feminism nowadays. Her considerations on constructing subjectivity of women, the key task for the feminist theory currently, focus around a metaphor (being more precise - a figure) of a nomad. The concept of nomadic subjectivity presented in her flagship work Pod*mioty nomadyczne*<sup>2</sup> seems to be one of the most interesting proposals developed in the frame of the so-called third feminism wave, being at the same time the response to the crisis (death) of the subject spread by 'male' philosophers. I would like to use this cognitively inspiring perspective to take a closer look at the artistic project by Pippa Bacca and Silvia Moro, who in 2008 started a long journey hitchhiking from Milan to Tel Aviv with the message of peace for the visited countries affected by conflicts. Brides on tour were much talked about for a certain time - because of the tragic end of the project - mainly in Italian and Turkish media. It raised many controversies and various comments, moreover, its new context added after the death of Pippa made it become a point of reference for next artistic ventures. The critical potential in Braidotti 's concepts seems adequate to me to try to capture, and then present, the degree to which the project

of Italian artists is a feminist project. I, therefore, assume that it is 'a critical and life experience of discovering', in which such categories as 'difference', 'change', 'between' play a fundamental role and this fact makes it justified as a whole. Against a wave of criticism, of which the sharpest form was 'feminism literally kills women' and the lightest was accusation of 'naïve faith in the Other', it is an important declaration. It automatically entails a question on female subjectivity towards power and culture, whose various dimensions of 'oppression' may be indicated in that situation. Together with Braidotti, therefore, I would like to face the tradition of treating the male as the universal; as the one being the norm and reference point – in order to demand, in response, the inclusion of specific, embodied female experience in the role of a subject active in culture and politics.

The story of Giuseppina Pasqualino di Marineo, known under artistic nickname of Pippa Bacca, has been recently brought back in the Modern Art Centre in Toruń 'Znaki Czasu' in the thrilling video performance Tooth for tooth by Nezeket Ekici (2016). In a separated room shrouded in darkness, attracting from the distance with cacophony of sounds, there were displayed eight screenings at the same time in which women - full of aggression, anger, grief, hatred reported cases of women murdered in the recent years in Turkey. One of the recalled deaths was the death of Pippa Bacca. It was 2008, a 33-year-old Italian girl, on her way to Israel, in her wedding dress, hitchhiking, is raped and strangled by a truck driver. The 'performer' in Ekici's film explained that she wanted to say that people are good, to yell out an accusation later: a girl is hitchhiking. You take her to your car, you leave [...]. You believed that you can do whatever you like? This story for a short moment was highlighted in the media worldwide, but it presented – I think – a quite superficial, partial and distorted image of this artistic project. They emphasized the message (promoting world peace and faith in people), the selection of the means of transport (hitchhiking), the tragic end of the project (death of the artist). *Brides on tour* seen from a closer, thus more precise, perspective, offer much more. It is not a naive improvisation of middle-class self-conceited European girls but a well-thought-over action prepared for around two years in advance, based on previous artistic experiences and beliefs of their authors.

The very idea, not crystalized yet, appeared accidentally during the wedding of Pippa Bacca's friend, as a kind of reflection on excessive attention focused by brides on the cleanliness of their wedding dresses - an outfit that is worn only on one day. It was the moment when the artist decided to 'break' the logics of that situation and reverse it totally. The dress was to become a witness of the special journey and experience of many days when not cleanliness, but dirt, dust, destruction and entailed memories of visited places and meetings with people would be the largest value. The dress was to be worn the whole day and taken off only for the night. The artist was 'captivated' first of all by the symbolic power of the dress and the very act of getting married. A bride has always been a symbol of femininity, love, family and cleanliness, and the wedding day - the moment of shared happiness and joy. Pippa Bacca wanted to spread this message related to peace to regions of the world affected by wars and conflicts. This task could have been done only by the 'Bride' in a white dress. Pippa Bacca found confirmation of the fact that it was the right choice in Ballad of a Woman by Edoardo Sanguinetti<sup>5</sup>, where in one of the verses one may find the words particularly important for her: as a woman she is not heaven, she is the earth, the body of the earth, who does not want war<sup>6</sup>. This is a beautiful poem, intense in its message, therefore touching, a sensitive tribute to a woman in her whole concreteness. Another such peculiar celebration of femininity referred to by the artist before the journey – was the poem by Leonard Cohen Joan of Arc7 from 1971. Also, these words were significant:

She said, I'm tired of the war,
I want the kind of work I had before,
A wedding dress or something white
To wear upon my swollen appetite.
[...]
Then fire, make your body cold,
I'm going to give you mine to hold,

Then fire, make your body cold,
I'm going to give you mine to hold,
Saying this she climbed inside
To be his one, to be his only bride.
And deep into his fiery heart
He took the dust of Joan of Arc,
And high above the wedding guests
He hung the ashes of her wedding dress.

In this way wedding dresses became the starting point for the realization of the artistic project, in which Pippa Bacca and Silvia Moro decided to go on their journey to the Near East. A reference to the archetype of getting married and the bride, present in all countries from Italy to Israel, was to liberate all positive associations. Moro mentioned that they wanted to witness reciprocal relations between various cultures, in particular women and their roles, documenting meetings with them during the journey and their conditions of life and work.

This is one of the reasons why in an artistic project of Italian artists a wedding dress had to be even more 'special' than usually. They were supported here by Manuel Facchini, artistic director of Byblos, a really famous Italian luxurious fashion brand. Facchini as a designer specializes in 'fusion' and his style resists syncretic 'blending and matching', while frequently reaching out for art motives. In the last years under his own name he created a feminine collection of sophisticated concept, where each outfit is as if a real work of art¹o. For

the purposes of *Brides on tour* he designed the dresses is such a way that on the one hand it was possible to exactly address the intentions of the authors of the project and take into account the planned route of the journey, and on the other – to unite the different personalities of the artists by the outfit as well.

Therefore, what did the outfit of the 'brides' and its elements look? It included three main parts: a robe, a jacket and a cape. The robe had a profile of a lily, a symbol of cleanliness and innocence, and eleven layers (petals) symbolizing eleven countries through which the journey went11. It was made of various natural fabrics and marked with embroidered numbers, like numbered pages in a book. Some of the layers could be detached, which was meant to facilitate later cleaning of the outfit. Some already had embroideries on them – stars of the Bosnian flag and Turkish crescent, Croatian chequerboard and Slovenian mountains. Also, the jacket with a slim feminine cut featured embroidery of a characteristic cider tree of Lebanon. The cape was made of two layers of white linen; therefore, it could be undone and then turned into a wide veil. Additionally, the artists decided to wear white high-heel shoes, irritating and uncomfortable when walking, as a symbolic emphasis of femininity, therefore sacrifice, which is an inherent attribute of a woman-mother. They also decided to use a crocheted headband covering their hair, adapting to the habits of Muslim countries. In some situations, the headband was to be replaced with a veil and a flower wreath.

The preparations for the journey included not only designing and making the dress. Before the journey, in February 2008, Pippa Bacca sent a special request to her friends. 'Come and burn something for us'. In the e-mail she explained that they may contribute to *Brides on tour*, as it will be necessary to clean the outfit from time to time, as traces will be left by the difficulties of each day and the passed kilometres. The artists planned that they would do it with lye, prepared

in the way known in ancient times, through boiling of sieved ash with water. Ash was to be created from burning objects owned by the invited guests, already possessed or created especially for this occasion, for example, newspaper articles, books or letters. It was not about any ritual act of cleaning to make the dresses new, but rather about removing a bit of dirt, dust, sweat. The created detergent was to fulfil its practical role for the whole journey, as well as its symbolic role, as 'a part of the house' left behind and accompanying them in the long and tiring journey.

It was an important part of the project to decide on making identical copies of both dresses. The first copy was taken by each of the 'brides', the second – untouched – was kept by their supporter, Byblos Art Gallery. The artists planned that after getting to Tel Aviv in May 2008 they would solemnly wash the dirty dresses publicly – to symbolically annul the traces of wars and conflicts left on it. Several months later, in November, there was to be an exhibition in a gallery in Verona (and more places), where the two identical dresses would be put on display next to each other, as well as the documentation of the journey.

All this shows clearly that the outfit was not to be only a symbol, but by its symbolic power also 'a tool' (medium) facilitating and making it possible to meet people. The artists travelled as two brides who went on a journey seeking universal aspects of femininity in various cultures, countries, religions. From meeting to meeting, unstoppably, always heading on – that was in fact their artistic journey. It was especially valuable for them to meet women representing classical, old female professions, they even sought such meetings. However, each of them used her own different artistic strategy. Bacca would first of all find municipal hospitals, and then midwives, who agreed to a conversation. She then made her performance, washing their feet with water and soap, drying them out with a cape of the wedding dress, rubbing

in oils. During these actions, she talked with the midwives, listened to their stories, recorded, dissipating any embarrassment, suspicion or misunderstanding concerning the washing ritual with her attitude. She showed in this way her respect to the female profession, which gave new life, or wider, she paid tribute to the life itself. Moro, on the other hand, looked for local lace makers and artists, asking them to add embroidery to her wedding dress. The embroidery was for her the central element of the wedding outfit, thus she cared the most to have more such 'interferences'. The artist saw how her dress changed every day, turning into an extraordinary work of art – a sign of multinationalism of the project.

This direct reference to joint experience – first of all female daily things and efforts - and the will to learn aspects of the female universe in other cultures, I treat as a very important declaration to understand the project Brides on tour. I see here the first similarity to the search for female subjectivity by Rosi Braidotti. The author of Podmioty nomadyczne - as explains Ewa Bińczyk - develops the approach that keeps the idea of sexual difference, as gender is here a significant difference funding subjectivity. [...] At the same time Braidotti 's philosophy adds positive value to the experience of femininity, seeking ways to creatively articulate what is feminine, avoiding situating women in a position of an inferior Other within our culture. The author [...] wants to create space for articulation where cultural traditions of women, 'their experience, know-how, cumulating history' can be exposed12. Both Pippa Bacca and Silvia Moro, focusing on women and building a joint project around the category of femininity, affirmed the concept of the difference. It seems to me that they did it similarly to how Braidotti understood it.

The second equally important similarity is seen in the role of the wedding dress in *Brides on tour* – undoubtedly one of the most significant cultural traditions of women. When analysing further activity of the Italian artists, one may be tempted to say that in their perspective the dress in a special way embodies both biology and culture, because it respects the requirements of the sexes, and at the same time refers to the external conditions imposed by the society. Additionally, it becomes a witness of the journey with all its ups and downs. Surprisingly enough, it all reminds of what Braidotti wrote about the female body in the frame of the concept of the nomadic subject. It situates itself somewhere 'between' the two positions in the so-called identity discourse<sup>13</sup>, not considering the body as something constituted only biologically, or constituted only by cultural conditions. In her understanding, the body exceeds the limits of what is natural and cultural, as on the one hand, when creating the structure of subjectivity, it is always passed through emotions, language and culture, on the other hand - becomes the starting dimension of identity and subjectivity. In consequence the body in Braidotti 's project - as convinces Agnieszka Jagusiak - serves as a place for recording. The body of a person, like cartograph characters on a map, records all experiences, lived places and situations<sup>14</sup>.

This function, indeed, that is fulfilled by the dress of the *brides*, is also a consequence of the choice to hitchhike. This choice was a result of previous experiences, mainly of Pippa Bacca, but mostly of the assumptions of the project, which put direct contact with people and magic of meetings in the first place. Hitchhiking gives such a remarkable chance, even forces relations and sharing the reality of living. On the other hand, it assumes selfless help, mutual trust between a driver and a hitchhiker, thus, it is somewhat giving one's life into the hands of other people. The artists spoke directly about it: going on a hitchhiking journey is choosing to believe in other people, and a man, 'in his own little way, like God', awards those who have faith¹5. This sentence – in the context of what happened later – is in my opinion important to understand the motives of *Brides on tour*. It is worth emphasizing that hitchhiking as a means of transport was particularly

important for Pippa. The artist could not imagine any other way of travelling: already as a child she had hitchhiked (with her mother), later she had travelled to her friends every weekend, but first of all she had gone by herself from Sankt Petersburg to Istanbul and from Finisterre (a cape in Spain, thought to be the end of the world in the past) to Ireland. She thought it was safe. She had realized another project before, Più oltre (2004), where she had taken photos of drivers who gave her a ride, creating a series of car-shaped portraits. Thinking of Brides on tour in order to facilitate communication with potential drivers she studied Arabic for more than a year (and additionally she worked in a call centre, saving money for the journey). Because of that, only hitchhiking gave her - one may say privileged - access to local people, by breaking the encountered barriers, social and cultural, as anyone could be a driver and a host. Without that faith in humans the journey would not have made sense for the artist. She was not scared of dangers of the journey as the only thing that scared her was the cold and wild animals, but she did not expect them on her way to Tel Aviv.

The motive of a journey in a sense is used also by Rosi Braidotti in her theory. As for her, the central category of terms is a nomad (or a bit wider – nomadism). According to the Polish dictionary this word meant primarily a tribe member leading a nomadic life. Nowadays we use this word to name a wanderer, someone who often changes the place of living. All the attributes mentioned match, according to the philosopher, the condition of a contemporary human, and even more a woman. In the history of the West a woman has never been a full subject, like a man. Not being properly represented, she could not speak her voice, therefore, for centuries she was subordinated to a man who defined and appointed her place in society. This lack of own legitimate place is compared by Braidotti to the nomad, wandering around in a patriarchal society, being the source of oppression,

exclusion and discrimination. All women, due to many centuries of patriarchy remain nomads, homeless in culture – as convinced the author of *Podmioty nomadyczne*<sup>16</sup>.

Thus, she also sees the necessity of such feminist theory, which allows to create a female subject (nomadic), namely embodied, and at the same time changeable, multiple, heterogeneous, constantly becoming 'somewhat'. It seems that 'the wandering bride' by Pippa Bacca and Sylvia Moro matches the scheme very well. They are open 'subjects' in the project which get their shape during successive meetings with people encountered on the route. It is not a finished process, as in this situation they do not pursue anchoring and endurance, but on the contrary, they are constantly on the move. They are constantly looking for their definition and become richer - also in the sense of 'traces' on the dress – with new experiences. Western culture reduced femininity and women to something worse, devaluated, indicating, among others, physicality and biology. Therefore, now they have to go outside the phallocentric look which is shown in the conviction that the description of the world and the human includes only the men's view which is universalized (femininity and feminine things, pushed to the margins and not allowed to speak). However, this vision is based on giving the central place to reason, order, law and theory<sup>17</sup>.

In that sense, Braidotti would probably look at the performance *Brides on tour* through the prism of how (female) identity was construed in there and whether there appeared the possibility (appropriateness) of re-evaluating the position of women. Unfortunately, the journey, started symbolically on 8<sup>th</sup> March on the International Women's Day, ended less than a month later. During this time the artists followed the plan and travelled through Slovenia, Croatia, Bosnia, Serbia, Bulgaria, stopping in private houses, visiting galleries and hospitals. They waited for a ride at road sides, holding cards with the names of destinations – subsequent hosts wrote the names

of their next journey destinations in their local languages. Accommodation was usually booked before the journey through Servas, sometimes provided by local art galleries. Finally, they got to Turkey and Istanbul – here, they decided to split to reunite in Beirut. This did not happen. On 31<sup>st</sup> March 2008 Pippa went missing, there was no message from her, her phone was dead. On 11<sup>th</sup> April her naked body was found. They caught the perpetrator quite fast – he appeared to be a 38-year-old truck driver, already having a criminal record due to theft. Several days later the funeral took place in Milan, a crowd of people wanted to say goodbye to the artist buried in a coffin wrapped in her favourite green fabric; after the ceremony green balloons were released to the sky. The murder shocked the Italian and Turkish public. The DNA tests showed traces of group rape, but no other perpetrators were identified – the only one arrested was excusing himself with alcohol, drugs and lack of memory; finally, he was sentenced to life.

*Brides on tour* as some kind of artistic performance was therefore disrupted. One may say, however, that the project started to live its own life, although not literally, being an inspiration or reference for artistic (and not only) actions - realized mainly in two countries directly affected by its tragic ending. There were actions organized aiming at honouring the memory of the artist and maintaining her message, as well as - addressing the new context imposed by her death - touching on the problem of violence against women. The incomplete agenda of artistic events is as follows: in 2008 there is the exhibition and panel discussion 'Bride to Peace' that were organized as a tribute to Pippa Bacca by the Turkish Art Association (UPSD) attended by 32 Turkish and 37 Italian artists. One of the works was presented by Ekin Onat, an artist living and working in Istanbul and Berlin, often subjecting to a critical reflection the socialpolitical conditions of her country and their irreversible impact both on individuals and the society as a whole. Her installation presented

the murdered women abandoned in various places wearing wedding dresses, but only small parts of their bodies were visible<sup>18</sup>. In 2009 – the opening of the exhibition 'Brides on Tour, Spose in Viaggio' in Verona. A similar exhibition was organized in Milan. The same year the Festival of Women Excellence in Genoa (Festival dell'Eccellenza al Femminile) – the leading motive of the festival always involves women; this particular edition was dedicated to the memory of the dead artist.

The year 2010 started with a premiere of the show I love Pippa Bacca. Ask me why! directed by Giulia Morello. The Italian director and writer was one of the people who engaged the most in preserving the memory of Pippa Bacca. She did not personally know the artist before, but the news of her tragic death made her want to know who in reality Giuseppina Pasqualino di Marineo, hiding behind the stage name of Pippa Bacca, was. Going deeper into her life and art Giulia Morello wanted to show how much these aspects are inseparable in Pippa Bacca's story and that this was the thing that made her start the journey from Milan to far-away Tel Aviv. First in 2010 the said show was created, and five years later a book under the same title, referring to one of the earlier actions of the artist. On the 10th anniversary of Pippa's death Morello again asked the title question, this time addressing it to the people who knew Pippa, asking them to record a short video with their answers. In this way, with combined efforts, there was a film created which showed the dead artist again from another perspective.

The year 2010 brought also the opening of the exhibition in Istanbul 'Modern artist between Italy and Turkey', which became a part of the annual program promoting Istanbul as the European Capital of Culture. The exhibition included outfits of both artists – "brides" – and photos from the journey. At around this time, a Turkish artist Bingöl Elmas, dressed in black as a symbol of grief, re-started the disrupted journey of Silvia Moro and Pippa Bacca, from the place of

her death to the Syrian border. The project resulted in a documentary My Letter to Pippa<sup>19</sup>. In 2011 a young Dutch photographer Jeans Van Daele prepared a dance show Brides for Peace, telling the story of Brides on tour. In 2012 Joël Curtz shot a 40-minute documentary titled simply *The Bride*, 2012<sup>20</sup>. The film starts with a scene in which one can see a bride filming herself and a truck driver, to reveal after a moment that she was murdered close to Istanbul. The whole, edited with authentic films of Pippa, showed first of all the value of meeting people. The realization of the action This is not a fashion show (Non sfilata) was an important event of 2013. Neither the time nor the place were accidental. Milan is the European fashion capital and the Mecca of the best world designers, while in February (or March) there is organized the annual Milan Fashion Week. It coincided with the program Natura Donna Impresa Verso, where only collections designed by women were presented. The tragically ended project had many important plots related to fashion: it referred to the outfit (feminine, extraordinary even within the convention of a wedding dress), and at the same time supported by one of the largest fashion houses. In the middle of both Milan events several key points in the city were taken over by women of different ages, wearing white wedding dresses with a photo of Pippa on each of them. This in fact was not a fashion show, but a quite palpably revived story of Brides on tour. One may indeed say that for the time of that action – in the moment when its participants put on the identity of the 'brides' – the project was symbolically continued. In 2016 in Toruń, during a large collective presentation of Turkish art, there was a video performance presented by Nezeket Ekci, presenting violence towards women, recalling the story of Pippa. The years of 2015 and 2018 are the years of the premiere of the above-mentioned book and film of Giulia Morello.

All of these realizations again make us become aware that it was the meeting with people that was key to the project of *Brides on tour* 

and its most important component. The rest, like the outfits or the revealed ideology, were the relevant frame for the meeting. In this context it becomes important for me to understand the idea of hospitality. This plot is developed by Irina Aristarkhova<sup>21</sup> in her essay *Baiting Hospitality*. The researcher suggests that indeed in that case the category of hospitality appeared to be a bait. Many commentators assessed the project and attitude of the artists as naïve or crazy – can't a white middle-class woman, an Italian citizen and a Catholic, understand that the whole world is not her home, is just not hers? On the other hand, statistics of murders and rapes show that we should rather fear domestic spaces than sides of roads used by hitchhikers.

For Pippa Bacca the faith in humans was the foundation of *Brides* on tour. Wearing a white dress as a symbol of peace tested hospitality of strangers every day. Her attitude to this aspect was dogmatic, and in this point she was different from Silvia Moro. For Pippa refusing to get into a car that stopped would be a betrayal of the whole idea, however, her friend got into cars only when she saw 'good faces' of drivers. This difference between the attitudes of both women was not only a matter of different artistic intentions but reflected the faith (or its lack) in unconditional hospitality belonging to the tradition called 'Abraham hospitality' by Jacques Derrida (including Judaism, Christianity and Islam)22. Against that background - as pointed by Aristarkhova – sex differences are the key elements differentiating the behaviour between the private and public spheres. This hospitality tradition was discussed by the French philosopher on the basis of biblical examples, referring to the story of Lot, who in the Book of Genesis offered his daughters to the men of Sodom, defending the honour of the host. In the Book of Judges, a similar story involved a wife who was also sacrificed because to disgrace a guest was unacceptable<sup>23</sup>. These situations may be explained with the said law of hospitality which was one of the most important laws, inherited from

nomadic 'people of the desert'. Each person who was offered even as little as water was treated as a special guest in the house. Therefore, if the person treated in this way was harmed, the host's house would fall into disgrace for his failure to keep the sacred law of asylum. The law was placed much higher in the primitive hierarchy of values than personal dignity of a woman. Maybe we are still heirs to this tradition, although the word 'we' can be referred only to men – if we take the biblical stories literally. In the 'original' text, women were excluded from that unconditional hospitality. It is, therefore, a thing to consider how much Bacca and Moro counted on the tradition which was not actually assigned to them – as women. Or, in other words, considering that the artists started their journey on the International Women Day, they symbolically breached the tradition according towhich women have their place in the private area and men's place is in the public?<sup>24</sup>. The self-proclaimed 'brides', wearing white dresses, directly introduced their bodies to the public, somehow contrary to the general belief that women cannot feel confident outside the private sphere. Undoubtedly, there is no equality in that perspective. The cosmopolitan attitude, in which the Brides on tour project clearly roots, may be treated - thinks Aristarkhova - as rooting from the idea of 'eternal peace', presented more than two hundred years ago by Immanuel Kant<sup>25</sup>. Maybe both artists pursued the possibility for every stranger to be treated without hostility, demanding hospitality as citizens of the world<sup>26</sup>. In that sense, the cosmopolitan dimension of hospitality meant simply 'home is the whole world', which simultaneously was a kind of challenge against the traditional division into the private and the public. The tragic end of the project - in the opinion of many commentators undermines this belief. And in consequence we go back to the starting point, where men protected women against other men outside their own house.

The view of Rosi Braidotti on this issue - in the light of the previously presented views - is obvious. I think that she would reply directly that such approach would mean pushing women back to the private area again with their presumed (usually imposed) passiveness. As there came the time to think (and act) – not only about cosmopolitan hospitability - beyond the traditional categories of sex differences, what is more, these private areas where women are said to be safe, very often appear to be faction. It was shown - not to seek too far - by the above-mentioned Nezaket Ekici, whose moving and amazingly emotional project *Tooth for tooth* reveals to the wider public the violence against women in a strongly patriarchal society, subject to intensive modernization changes. Turkey, spread between the West and the East, not only geographically, but also politically and culturally, is an example of a country where according to law women have equal rights to men<sup>27</sup>, and where sexual violence is present at home, in the streets, in schools. A Turkish family is headed by a man, a woman for her whole life is under custody of a male family member who is responsible for her security and honour. In this way her rights may be limited for the sake of her good and safety, which is sanctioned with a multi-generation, but still vivid, tradition of tribal societies. Therefore, it is not surprising to read in reports on honour murders: a daughter should be obedient, respect the family, should not work, it is much better for her to get married when the time is right (a 30-year-old imam from a large city); when a man walks in the street, a woman should stay behind the house doors (77-year-old citizen of Istanbul); honour of the family is the most important (21-year-old woman from Istanbul)<sup>28</sup>.

The tragedy of Pippa Bacca became in Turkey a matter of national shame, the highest state authorities got involved. As a consequence of her death, a part of Turkish feminists reminded than many murders and rapes of women still avoid punishment, and moreover, was Pippa not Italian, then probably the case would not have been

penalized in the end<sup>29</sup>. Esra Aşan suggested that the whole media campaign involving state institutions, condolences, apologies to the Italian nation was some kind of a big fraud, as life goes on without bigger changes, and violence against women still exists<sup>30</sup>. In Gebze, where the 'bride's' rape took place, there was another such act committed soon after. It did not result in an official national mobilization campaign in that scope.

Therefore, the key question is: how to explain the death of Pippa Bacca? Was her death work of a sick perpetrator, or an effect of the system dominated by men, where women are excluded from the public sphere, do not take part in taking decisions, are subjects of desire?<sup>31</sup>. Initiatives towards a change of this situation have always been bottom-up, there were many of them, but two of them described below are worth comparing. One of them was the action 'We are not men', in which a group of men in front of a school in Galatasaray questioned their own masculinity: if raping is masculinity, we are not men; if honour is masculinity, we are not humans; if hatred to homosexuality is masculinity, we are not men; if making women's life unbearable is masculinity, we are not men<sup>32</sup>. It was organized several days after the tragic end of the Brides on tour. Nine years later, 70 women organizations from the whole Turkey took part in the March of Justice, reminding of the story of Pippa in the face of stricter and stricter politics of violence and impunity of men. The following years have not changed the situation in the country because, as women accused during this action, 'men's justice is not real justice' or also 'where there are no women, there is no justice, equality or democracy'.

But, as shown by Rosi Braidotti, the main objective of feminism is a change, which is precisely described by Ewa Bińczyk<sup>33</sup>. This change is to contribute mainly to re-evaluation of the position of women, however, one cannot forget here that it covers also changing the way they are presented. It is important as the patriarchal culture

produces and suggests its own 'figure of a woman', which is fictitious for Braidotti and, therefore, requires keeping a constant distance to it. 'She calls 'a woman' the main artefact of patriarchal culture whose acceptance sustains reproduction of current domination structures<sup>54</sup>. There is only one solution for women in that situation: they should make their own politics, which means that it is necessary to take a certain position (opposing the dominant models of hegemony) and to take responsibility for what surrounds us 'here and now'. From the perspective given to us by the author of *Podmioty nomadyczne* it may be said that *Brides on tour* are in line with these tactics.

Pippa Bacca and Silvia Moro in their project research topics important from the point of view of culture, connected first of all with femininity. Everything is pertinently selected, presents precise symbolism, refers to many female rituals. I can successfully emphasize here the theme of a journey understood as the moment of confrontation and transformation which has a deep impact on itself and on others; the theme of a dialogue between cultures or models of behaviour; the theme of a woman as the subject bringing (generating) life. This is possible as the project is based on the concept of art understood as relation. In that context it is more important for the Italian artists to activate psychological, emotional and esthetic ties than a formal outcome of the artistic process. All these are documented in photos (sometimes spontaneous, sometimes well 'directed'), and next to them - the wedding dresses. These are the traces which, on the one hand, express the time dimension of *Brides on tour* and, on the other hand, preserve the memory of them. In my opinion, the real value of this project is situated in the experience of living; in the exchange that the artists make with people met on the way; in breaking limits between art and daily life; in sharing gestures and emotions. It seems to me that it is quite an alternative model of art, based on participation and sharing, and as such, is a response to the feminist postulates of Rosi Braidotti.

- R. Braidotti, Metamorphoses. Towards a Materialist Theory of Becoming, Oxford 2002, p. 12, op. cit.: A. Derra, Ciałokobieta-różnica w nomadycznej teorii podmiotu Rosi Braidotti, [in:] Terytorium i peryferia cielesności. Ciało w dyskursie filozoficznym, ed. A. Kiepas, E. Struzik, Katowice 2010, p. 452.
- 2 More see: R. Braidotti, Podmioty nomadyczne. Ucieleśnienie i różnica seksualna w feminizmie współczesnym, transl. A. Derra, Warsaw 2009. Compare with A. Ciechanowska, Opisując nomadę..., 'Kultura Współczesna' No. 4 (2010), p. 201–208 [book review].
- The quotation from the film Zqb za zqb; during the film there were Polish subtitles of the words uttered by the 'performers'.
- The story of Pippa Bacca presented based on information from the artist's website: http://www.pippabacca.it/category/sposain-viaggio [accessed on 3.05.2018].
- 5 Eduardo Sanguinetti (1930–2010) and Italian poet and critic, one of the most prominent representatives of the Italian neo-vanguard, participant of the radical movement of writers and individualists gathered in the so-called Gruppo 63, focused on breaking up with conformism and destruction of literary language. The Group included, among others, the following participants: Umberto Eco, Giorgio Manganelli, Nanni Ballestrini.
- 6 Original text in Italian: https://www. poesieracconti.it/poesie/a/edoardosanguineti/ballata-delle-donne [accessed on 5.05.2018]. What is interesting, the same verse became an inspiration - in a form of a sound 'image' - for another artistic project. As a result of international cooperation. coordinated by Patrizia Marti, between the University of Siena, Interactive Institute Swedish ICI in Umeä and Eindhoven University of Technology there started interactive installation Ballade of Women (2013). The starting point was three paintings from the collection of Fondazione Monte dei Paschi di Siena presenting famous
- historic characters. Narration of the authors of the installation led from personal women's experiences to important today's topics related with rights of women. So, emancipation was depicted on the example of Cleopatra and painting by Marco Pino (1570), self-determination - Maria Magdalena and painting of Rutilio Manetti (1627), violence - martyr Lucia from Syracuse and painting of Maestro dell'Osservanza. The installation formed dynamic space with 'floating' mobile parts, whose behaviour was influenced by both physical presence of the visitors, and virtual presence of commentators of the exhibition in discussion forums. They defined from scratch the frames of three paintings from particular points of view in the space. Authors of Ballade of Women suggested in such a way that each of us may contribute to putting together a harmonious image of complicated reality of the world of women based on the common topic, despite perspectives of various people from various countries. In other words. our presence and our ideas may change the world. Film from the exhibition is available on the website: https://vimeo. com/71131822 [accessed on 24.04.2018].
- 7 Original text: http://www.leonardcohenprologues.com/lyrics/joan.htm [accessed on 5.05.2018]. The artist for her own purposes used translation into Italian made by Fabrizio De André from 1972.
- 8 Translation by Maciej Zembaty, text as in the website: http://www.tekstowo.pl/piosenka,leonard\_cohen,joan\_of\_arc. html [accessed on 5.05.2018].
- Interview of Amedeo Novelli with Silvia Moro for the journal 'La Repubblica', interview of 21st April 2008. More – see: http://www.repubblica.it/2008/04/ sezioni/esteri/turchia-sposa-scomparsa/ intervista-giulia/intervista-giulia.html [accessed on 09.05.2018].
- More see: http://www.manuelfacchini. com/en/index.php; http://www.byblos.it/ dna.php [accessed on 7.05.2018].

- These were, in sequence from Italy: Slovenia, Croatia, Bosnia, Serbia. Bulgaria Turkey, Liban, Syria Egypt, Jordania, Israel.
- **12** E. Bińczyk, Uniesienia i potknięcia filozofii podmiotu. Projektowanie stanowisk feministycznych poza założeniami esencjalizmu, 'Teksty Drugie' No. 4 (2011), p. 75.
- it was defined as a dispute between essentialism (biological sex has the highest importance in defining sexual identity of a human) and constructivism (sex is a social-cultural construction). More see: A. Burzyńska, M.P. Markowski, Teorie literatury XX wieku. Podręcznik, Cracow 2006, p. 445–446.
- 24 A. Jagusiak, W kierunku ciała, czyli podmiot ucieleśniony według Elizabeth Grosz i Rosi Braidotti, 'Machina Myśli' 2016, http://machinamysli.org/ podmiot-ucielesniony-wedlug-groszoraz-braidotti [accessed on 04.05.2018]. See also: A. Derrra, Ciało-kobietaróżnica..., p. 452– 455; A. Jagusiak, Podmiot nomadyczny Rosi Braidotti. Postkryzysowa teoria podmiotu, [in:] Narracje postkryzysowe w humanistyce, ed. D. Kotula, A. Piórkowska, A. Poterała, Olsztyn 2014, p. 139–154.
- 15 Op. cit.: http://www.pippabacca.it/ category/sposa-in-viaggio [accessed on 3.05.2018].
- **16** R. Braidotti, *Podmioty nomadyczne...*, op. cit., p. 8–9.
- 17 Ibid, p. 287.
- http://www.ekinonat.com/galleries/ pippa-bacca [accessed on 4.05.2018].
- My Letter to Pippa (Pippa'ya Mektubum), 2010, duration: 60 minutes, directed by: B. Elmas, produced by: Asmin Film Production.
- 20 The Bride (La Mariée), 2012, duration: 40 minutes, directed by: J. Curtz, produced by: Le Fresnoy, Studio national des arts contemporains, world premiere in the International Festival of Documentaries in Amsterdam (IDFA).
- 21 I. Aristarkhova, Baiting Hospitality, [in:]

- Security and Hospitality in Literature and Culture: Modern and Contemporary Perspectives, J. Clapp, E. Ridge (eds.), New York 2016, p. 64–77.
- J. Derrida, On Cosmopolitanism and Forgiveness (Thinking in Action), London 2001, p. 17 (and further).
- Comp. with the Book of Genesis 19, 1–11; Book of Judges 19, 22–30.
- 24 In that sense the death of Pippa Bacca may show a difficult story of sexual harassment against women, who refuse to follow the defined and imposed order in the private/public sphere. Diana Scully on the cover of her book on sexual violence wrote that the problem of raped people is being in the wrong place at the wrong time. I think that it has to be emphasized that these are men who are responsible for sexual violence and it is the problem of men, not women. Maybe the only way to fight this phenomenon is to change the relation of power and domination of one sex over the other - D. Scully, Understanding Sexual Violence. A Study of Convicted Ravists, London 1990. Here it is worth highlighting the famous slogan of Kate Millet private is political. As reminded by Monika Świerkosz, undermining the traditional division of reality to home (female) and public (male), it became the pillar of political feminism. More - see: M. Świerkosz, Przestrzeń w filozoficznej refleksji feministycznej, 'Teksty Drugie' 4 (2011), p. 86-104.
- **25** More see: I. Kant, *Wieczny pokój*, transl. Józef Mondschein, Toruń 1992.
- Georg Simmel 'Alien', so a wanderer, buyer, came and left. His presence satisfied curiosity of the world, new unknown objects or habits, however, in itself it was not a challenge. 'Alien' sooner or later left. I think such a status could be gained in their journey by 'brides' who raised interest or awe as 'attraction of the day'. They could have been then taken to another place or kept for the night. As the next day they were just not here. Comp. with G. Simmel,

- Obcy, [in:] G. Simmel, Most i drzwi. Wybór esejów, transl. M. Łukasiewicz, Warsaw 2005, p. 204.
- 27 Turkish society, law, culture in the context of rights and situation of women werw analyzed among others by: D. Chmielowska, A. Kihe-Eryilmaz, Społeczna i rodzinna sytuacja kobiety tureckiej, [in:] D. Chmielowska, E. Machut-Mendecka (ed.), Być kobieta w Oriencie, Warsaw 2008, p. 46-55; B. Kowalska. O upadku imperium. republice i zasłonie. Zmagania kobiet tureckich o autonomie. [in:] B. Kowalska. K. Zielińska, B. Koschalk (ed.), Gender: Kobieta w kulturze i społeczeństwie, Kraków 2009, p. 105-132; M. Kiebała, Kobieta w prawie tureckim, http://www. politykaglobalna.pl/2009/03/kobietaw-prawie-tureckim/ [accessed on 25.01.2018]; M. Ksieniewicz, Być kobieta w Turcji, 'Niebieska Linia' 1 (2010), http:// www.niebieskalinia.pl/pismo/wydania/ dostepne-artykuly/4940-byc-kobieta-wturcji [accessed on 23.01.2018].
- 28 The Dynamics of Honour Killings in Turkey, Prospects for Action, UNDP. UNFPA, 2007, p. 19-20, http://www. unfpa.org/sites/default/files/pubpdf/honourkillings.pdf [accessed by 25.01.2018]. Report prepared for UN institutions UNFPA and UNDP. It is a summary and evaluation of quality research on so-called 'honour assassination'. It focused on various perceptions of 'honour' and consequences to be faced by people involved in 'dishonourable behaviour'. The authors of the document analyse also its impact on social structures, ways of living, thinking structures. More - see: G. Zietkiewicz, Turcia kraj kontrastów i zbiorowych morderstw z zazdrości, http://www.mojeopinie.pl/ turcja\_kraj\_kontrastow\_i\_zbiorowych\_ morderstw\_z\_zazdrosci,3,1241676364 [accessed on 25.0.2018]; E. Orhan, Być kobietą w Turcji, 'Przegląd' 14 (2017). https://www.tygodnikprzeglad.pl/byc-

kobieta-turcji [accessed on 25.0.2018];

- Przemoc zaczyna się w rodzinie, Amnesty International, https://amnesty.org.pl/turcja-przemoc-zaczynasi%C4%99-w-rodzinie [accessed on 25.01.2018].
- 29 It was also mentioned in the Polish media: Comments after the rape and murder of Giuseppina Pasqualino di Marineo do not give hope [...], in the editor comment a Turkish journal 'Today's Zaman' said directly: 'If Pippa was Turkish, some people would have no hesitation to say that a hitchhiking woman asks for being raped' A. Wawrzyńczak, Fala przemocy wobec kobiet w Turcji śmierć 20-latki jak mroczny symbol, https://wiadomosci.wp.pl/fala-przemocy-wobec-kobiet-wturcji-smierc-20-latki-jak-mroczny-symbol-6025260556772481a [accessed on 2.05.2018].
- http://www.bgst.org/toplumsal-cinsiyet-gundem/pippa-baccanin-ardindan [accessed on 9.05.2018]. At least 577 women were raped in 2008 and at least 80 were killed. In 2009 those were correspondingly 652 and 109, in 2010 288 and 180, in 2011 102 and 210, in 2012 150 and 210, in 2013 167 and 237. Data from the website: http://www.hafizakaydi.org/31mart/pippa-bacca [accessed on 4.05.2018].
- http://bianet.org/kurdi/biamag/106419pippa-bacca-icin [accessed on 09.05.2018].
- N. Mutluer, We Conversed with Men, http://www.amargidergi.com/ yeni/?p=511 [accessed on 9.05.2018].
- E. Bińczyk, Uniesienia i potknięcia filozofii podmiotu..., op. cit., p. 79. In this context it is worth reading an article of Ewa Hyży where she tracks the presence of feminism in contemporary ethical-political discussions, from so-called 'ethics of care' to global theories of the rights of women as the rights of humans: E. Hyży, Wybrane etyczno-polityczne propozycje współczesnego feminizmu globalnego, 'Etyka' 45 (2012), p. 16–36.
- **34** E. Bińczyk, *Uniesienia i potknięcia filozofii podmiotu...*, op. cit., p. 79. See also: R. Braidotti, *Podmioty nomadyczne...*, op. cit., p. 200, 222, 227.

190

## Anna Dzierżyc-Horniak

The Woman Is a Nomad, the Woman Is an Artist. A look at Brides on Tour by Pippa Bacca and Silvia Moro in the Feminist Take of Rosa Braidotti

The text is an attempt at looking at the art project Brides on Tour from the perspective of the nomadic subjectivity by Rosi Braidotti. The project, in the new context lent by the death of Giuseppina Pasqualino di Marineo, known under as Pippa Bacca, gave rise to diverse commentaries, at the same time becoming a reference point for successive artistic and social endeavours. The article analyses the strategy undertaken by "the brides" as women-artists, the cultural symbols and archetypes used by them, while as a counterweight questions are asked about the faith in unconditioned hospitality in the frames of what Jacques Derrida called "Abraham" tradition as well as about the presence of women in public space.

As a result, the project seems to be an artistic performance, which demands including the specific, embodied female experience to be a subject in culture and politics. Its true value is located in the acquired experience; in the exchange that the artists initiate with people encountered on their way; in breaking the borders between art and everyday life. This is quite an alternative model of art and as such is an answer to the feminist demands of Rosi Braidotti.

KEYWORDS:

FEMALE SUBJECTIVITY, ART AS RELATIONS, NOMADISM, HOSPITALITY



Paid by the Ministry of Science and Higher Education according to the agreement no. 796/P-DUN/2018 signed on 4.04.2018 r.

The assignment name: Creation of the English version of the Scientific-artistic Journal "Dyskurs" publications; DUN financing – 30 000 PLN.

Zbigniew Tomaszczuk Best wishes on this journey as you build your new lives together 1987

